

Verwertung

Encyclopedia: "The concept as concrete, and in fact any particular is essentially in itself a unity of diverse determinations." But how does ~~it~~ either prove the movement from abstract to concrete as the methodology Marx used in Capital. In fact, far from being the final stage of concretization, when labor was the concept Marx had intended to start with, Marx changed his mind to start with the commodity and when he told the reader at once that he must go to labor, it was not labor as concrete, but labor as ~~the most~~ contradictory of all concepts, the absolute contradiction, specifically capitalistic, between abstract labor which produces all value and concrete labor which produces the use value.

RR does make some important points when he deals with the transition from Capital to landed property and from landed property to wage labor, and is especially good later on when he shows that it isn't true that Marx didn't use the book on landed property, but included it in Vol. III. P. 42 is especially good in showing that, as far back as 1857, Marx (Grundrisse p. 651)

predicts the form of monopoly capitalism" after which he quotes Marx (p. 730) "generally competition is the means by which capital carries through its mode of production" even as on page 650-51 Marx had said that conceptually competition is "none other than the inner nature of capital appearing and realized as the interaction of many capitals." (I must here remark that on p. 45 Verwertung is to me correctly translated as "expansion of value" and in other places as "realization of value" and I do not understand why suddenly this author basing himself on Ben Fowkes' translation of Capital, using the word valorization.)

Appendix to this part, "Methodological Comments on RL's Critique of Marx's Schema of Reproduction", states that since so much was written on the incorrectness of the schema, he will not spend time on this schema. What he doesn't understand is why the methodological premises were not criticized, for that is the most important [RR must have known about my criticism precisely of the methodology, precisely of the relationship ~~and~~ between reality and theory, since the critique of RL was published some 14 years before M&F, and since I had a considerable number of debates on the whole question at that time of how methodology, specifically pragmatism, led everyone astray also on the law of value. The most fantastic

TR

And as if that or the other proved anything, RR ends triumphantly with an exclamation point on this sentence: "Their disregard of Marx's dialectics thus took its eventual revenge on them!" (p.454)

On p. 460 RR goes back to the Narodniks and Engels onto Bulgakov and Tugan-Baranovsky, but the critique of Lenin is hardly understandable in view of the fact that he agrees with all of Lenin against the Narodniki and for the historic correctness of Lenin's analysis of Russian capitalism as well as Lenin's contention that there is no contradiction between Volumes II and III. And yet the very title, "Lenin's Theory of Realization" carries a fn. which states that this is important because ~~these~~ are evidently appended by the Russians to Capital itself "apparently to serve as a kind of official exegeses of Marx's work". This practice began in the 1930s and Lenin would certainly not have tolerated it, if he had been alive." Obviously (p. 477) RR does not accept that c really predominates over v all the time. RR also holds that because of this weakness in Lenin's theory of realization, came Lenin's "complete rejection of Rosa Luxemburg's book". Here he quotes (p.480) what Lenin wrote in March 1913 to the publisher: "I have just read Rosa's new book...she has got into a shocking muddle. She has distorted Marx. I'm very glad that Pannekoek, Eckstein, and Otto Bauer have all condemned her book with one accord and used the same arguments which I already used against the Narodniki in 1899. I intend to write about Rosa in No. 4 of Prosveshchenie." On p. 481 RR returns to the fact that the most important of all of the aspects is methodological, whereupon supposedly Lenin did not understand the methodology because ~~XXXXXX~~ "when the young Lenin wrote his treatise on the realization problem neither Marx's theories of surplus value nor the Grundrisse were known to him: he could have had only less than an adequate insight into the methodologically very complex structure of Marx's economic work. We now know that according to Marx's plan for the structure of the work, the 1st 2 volumes only figure as the analysis of "Capital in General" and that consequently the results which Marx obtained in these volumes -- although extraordinarily important -- still had to be concretized by a later stage of the analysis, that of "Capital in concrete reality."

literature which consciously and in detail takes up the question of the methodology of Marx's Capital." (p. 552) The very last section is one again called "On the method of Marx's Economics" (pp 561-572). ~~But~~ He says that Lange devotes no less than 3 chapters to the question of methodology: 1) on the economic laws, 2) "contains a (somewhat dubious) presentation of the materialist conception of history; however, since sociology cannot serve as a substitute for political economy, the ~~methodological~~ methodological value of this chapter is very questionable. What remains is the 3rd chapter which deals directly with the 'Method of Pol. Econ.'"

3/1/77
3/3

Method

We're back to appearance and essence as the quintessence of Marxism, and where Marx singles out against Ricardo his lacking the power of abstraction, RR quotes from the Grundrisse (p. 327): "He never investigated the form of the mediation." On the question of results not being complete unless they are considered together with the process of arriving at them, RR has a ftn. 47 on p. 567: "It was in this sense that Hegel characterized 'objective logic' (the Doctrine of Being and Essence) as the 'genetic exposition of concepts' (Subjective Logic). (Science of Logic, Vol. II). cf. Lukacs op cit p. 175; 'This ability to go beyond the immediate ... means the transformation of the objective nature of the objects of action.'"

P. 570, the big climax of RR's claim to concentration on dialectics is that since 1939-40 when Grundrisse was first published, "ONE NO LONGER HAS TO BITE INTO THE SOUR APPLE AND 'THOROUGHLY STUDY THE WHOLE OF HEGEL'S LOGIC' IN ORDER TO UNDERSTAND MARX'S CAPITAL -- ONE CAN ARRIVE AT THE SAME END, DIRECTLY, BY STUDYING THE ROUGH DRAFT..... BUT UNFORTUNATELY, ~~IN~~ IN THE LIGHT OF THIS, O. LANGE'S OTHERWISE USEFUL AND INTERESTING BOOK, MAKES A REMARKABLY OLD-FASHIONED IMPRESSION: " (This awfully awful and awfully eridite author has all this praise of Lange, even though in a ftn. (56, p. 570) he calls attention to the fact that as late as 1959 he was still extolling Stalin for his great contributions to political economy.

Good

19

Perf. C
NB under p477 in date VIII
Critical Excursions
Add to class "L" - use
just that's
Lungs also are
Miserable

9.21/1/1971
The main aim to... on the...
Since...
p454 The basic...
M's Scheme Report

II p457 The... of the realization
II 460-473
Mandelstam, Dandelion
Bulgaria Super-Bureau
"Museum" of Med. Arguments

III p471 FR 90 VII "01" CR II
p482 - R.T. - from this...
Hegel's Critique
Because it's new my...
one thing are "prejudice" in

Handwritten notes in a circle:
p471
p472
p473
p474
p475
p476
p477
p478
p479
p480
p481
p482
p483
p484
p485
p486
p487
p488
p489
p490
p491
p492
p493
p494
p495
p496
p497
p498
p499
p500
p501
p502
p503
p504
p505
p506
p507
p508
p509
p510
p511
p512
p513
p514
p515
p516
p517
p518
p519
p520
p521
p522
p523
p524
p525
p526
p527
p528
p529
p530
p531
p532
p533
p534
p535
p536
p537
p538
p539
p540
p541
p542
p543
p544
p545
p546
p547
p548
p549
p550
p551
p552
p553
p554
p555
p556
p557
p558
p559
p560
p561
p562
p563
p564
p565
p566
p567
p568
p569
p570
p571
p572
p573
p574
p575
p576
p577
p578
p579
p580
p581
p582
p583
p584
p585
p586
p587
p588
p589
p590
p591
p592
p593
p594
p595
p596
p597
p598
p599
p600
p601
p602
p603
p604
p605
p606
p607
p608
p609
p610
p611
p612
p613
p614
p615
p616
p617
p618
p619
p620
p621
p622
p623
p624
p625
p626
p627
p628
p629
p630
p631
p632
p633
p634
p635
p636
p637
p638
p639
p640
p641
p642
p643
p644
p645
p646
p647
p648
p649
p650
p651
p652
p653
p654
p655
p656
p657
p658
p659
p660
p661
p662
p663
p664
p665
p666
p667
p668
p669
p670
p671
p672
p673
p674
p675
p676
p677
p678
p679
p680
p681
p682
p683
p684
p685
p686
p687
p688
p689
p690
p691
p692
p693
p694
p695
p696
p697
p698
p699
p700
p701
p702
p703
p704
p705
p706
p707
p708
p709
p710
p711
p712
p713
p714
p715
p716
p717
p718
p719
p720
p721
p722
p723
p724
p725
p726
p727
p728
p729
p730
p731
p732
p733
p734
p735
p736
p737
p738
p739
p740
p741
p742
p743
p744
p745
p746
p747
p748
p749
p750
p751
p752
p753
p754
p755
p756
p757
p758
p759
p760
p761
p762
p763
p764
p765
p766
p767
p768
p769
p770
p771
p772
p773
p774
p775
p776
p777
p778
p779
p780
p781
p782
p783
p784
p785
p786
p787
p788
p789
p790
p791
p792
p793
p794
p795
p796
p797
p798
p799
p800
p801
p802
p803
p804
p805
p806
p807
p808
p809
p810
p811
p812
p813
p814
p815
p816
p817
p818
p819
p820
p821
p822
p823
p824
p825
p826
p827
p828
p829
p830
p831
p832
p833
p834
p835
p836
p837
p838
p839
p840
p841
p842
p843
p844
p845
p846
p847
p848
p849
p850
p851
p852
p853
p854
p855
p856
p857
p858
p859
p860
p861
p862
p863
p864
p865
p866
p867
p868
p869
p870
p871
p872
p873
p874
p875
p876
p877
p878
p879
p880
p881
p882
p883
p884
p885
p886
p887
p888
p889
p890
p891
p892
p893
p894
p895
p896
p897
p898
p899
p900
p901
p902
p903
p904
p905
p906
p907
p908
p909
p910
p911
p912
p913
p914
p915
p916
p917
p918
p919
p920
p921
p922
p923
p924
p925
p926
p927
p928
p929
p930
p931
p932
p933
p934
p935
p936
p937
p938
p939
p940
p941
p942
p943
p944
p945
p946
p947
p948
p949
p950
p951
p952
p953
p954
p955
p956
p957
p958
p959
p960
p961
p962
p963
p964
p965
p966
p967
p968
p969
p970
p971
p972
p973
p974
p975
p976
p977
p978
p979
p980
p981
p982
p983
p984
p985
p986
p987
p988
p989
p990
p991
p992
p993
p994
p995
p996
p997
p998
p999
p1000

p493
did. centers
Hegel's style!

12527
Scale
1/2
1/4
1/8
1/16
1/32
1/64
1/128
1/256
1/512
1/1024
1/2048
1/4096
1/8192
1/16384
1/32768
1/65536
1/131072
1/262144
1/524288
1/1048576
1/2097152
1/4194304
1/8388608
1/16777216
1/33554432
1/67108864
1/134217728
1/268435456
1/536870912
1/1073741824
1/2147483648
1/4294967296
1/8589934592
1/17179869184
1/34359738368
1/68719476736
1/137438953472
1/274877906944
1/549755813888
1/1099511627776
1/2199023255552
1/4398046511104
1/8796093022208
1/17592186044416
1/35184372088832
1/70368744177664
1/140737488355328
1/281474976710656
1/562949953421312
1/1125899906842624
1/2251799813685248
1/4503599627370496
1/9007199254740992
1/18014398509481984
1/36028797018963968
1/72057594037927936
1/144115188075855872
1/288230376151711744
1/576460752303423488
1/1152921504606846976
1/2305843009213693952
1/4611686018427387904
1/9223372036854775808
1/18446744073709551616
1/36893488147419103232
1/73786976294838206464
1/147573952589676412928
1/295147905179352825856
1/590295810358705651712
1/1180591620717411303424
1/2361183241434822606848
1/4722366482869645213696
1/9444732965739290427392
1/18889465931478580854784
1/37778931862957161709568
1/75557863725914323419136
1/151115727451828646838272
1/302231454903657293676544
1/604462909807314587353088
1/1208925819614629174706176
1/2417851639229258349412352
1/4835703278458516698824704
1/9671406556917033397649408
1/19342813113834066795298816
1/38685626227668133590597632
1/77371252455336267181195264
1/154742504910672534362390528
1/309485009821345068724781056
1/618970019642690137449562112
1/1237940039285380274899244224
1/2475880078570760549798488448
1/4951760157141521099596976896
1/9903520314283042199193953792
1/19807040628566084398387907584
1/39614081257132168796775815168
1/79228162514264337593551630336
1/158456325028528675187103260672
1/316912650057057350374206521344
1/633825300114114700748413042688
1/1267650600228229401496826085376
1/2535301200456458802993652170752
1/5070602400912917605987304341504
1/10141204801825835211974608683008
1/20282409603651670423949217366016
1/40564819207303340847898434732032
1/81129638414606681695796869464064
1/162259276829213363391593789128128
1/324518553658426726783187578256256
1/649037107316853453566375156512512
1/1298074214633707107132750313025248
1/2596148429267414214265500626050496
1/5192296858534828428531001252100192
1/1038459371706965685706200250420384
1/2076918743413931371412400500840768
1/4153837486827862742824801001681536
1/8307674973655725485649602003363072
1/1661534994731145097129924006726144
1/3323069989462290194259848013522288
1/6646139978924580388519696027044576
1/13292279957849160777039392054091552
1/2658455991569832155407878410818304
1/5316911983139664310815756821636608
1/10633823966279328621631513643273216
1/21267647932558657243263027286546304
1/42535295865117314486526054573092608
1/85070591730234628973052109146185216
1/170141183460469257946104218292370432
1/340282366920938515892208436584740864
1/680564733841877031784416873169481728
1/1361129467683754063568833746338963456
1/2722258935367508127137667492677926912
1/5444517870735016254275334985355853824
1/10889035741470032508550669970711707648
1/2177807148294006501710133994142341536
1/4355614296588013003420267988284683072
1/8711228593176026006840535976569366144
1/17422457186352052013681071953138732288
1/348449143727041040273621439062774656
1/696898287454082080547242878125549312
1/13937965749081641610944857562510962464
1/27875931498163283221889711325021924928
1/55751862996326566443779422650043849664
1/111503725992653132887558845300087739328
1/223007451985306265775117690600175478656
1/446014903970612531550235381200350957312
1/892029807941225063100470762400701914624
1/1784059615882450126200941524801403829248
1/3568119231764900252401883049602807658496
1/7136238463529800504803766099205615316992
1/14272476927059601009607532198411230633984
1/28544953854119202019215064396822461267968
1/57089907708238404038430128793644922535936
1/114179815416476808076860257587289845071872
1/22835963083295361615372051517457969014344
1/45671926166590723230744103034915938028688
1/91343852333181446461488206069831876557376
1/1826877046663628929229764121396637511145504
1/365375409332725785845952824279327502291008
1/730750818665451571691915648558654004582016
1/1461501637330903143383831297117308009144384
1/292300327466180628676766259423461601828672
1/584600654932361257353532518846923203657344
1/1169201309864722514707065037693846407314688
1/23384026197294450294141300753876961462863776
1/46768052394588900588282601507753922925727552
1/9353610478917780117656520301550784585145504
1/18707220957835560235313040603101570111008
1/37414441915671120470626081206202140222016
1/74828883831342240941252164012404280444032
1/14965776766264448188250432802480856088064
1/299315535325288963765008656049617121772128
1/59863107065057792753001731209923424344448
1/11972621413011558550600346419846848688896
1/23945242826023117101200692839693697377792
1/478904856520462342024013856793873954755456
1/957809713040924684048027135587779109111104
1/1915619426081849368096054271755578218222208
1/38312388521636987361932108435111564444448
1/7662477704327397472386421687022312888896
1/15324955408654794944772843374044625777792
1/30649910817309589889545686748089515555456
1/61299821634619179779091373496180311111104
1/122599643269238359558182746992360622222208
1/24519928653847671911636549398472124444448
1/4903985730769534382327309879694424888896
1/9807971461539068764654619759388849777792
1/19615942922718137529309239518776995555456
1/39231885845436275058618479037553991111104
1/78463771690872550117236958075107982222208
1/156927543381745100234473916150215964444448
1/3138550867634902004689478323004318888896
1/627710173526980400937895664600863777792
1/1255420347053960801875791329201727555456
1/25108406941079216037515826584034551111104
1/5021681388215843207503165316869102222208
1/10043362776431686415006330633738204444448
1/200867255528633728300126612674640888896
1/40173451105726745660025325349281777792
1/80346902211453491320050650698563555456
1/1606938044229069826001013139171111104
1/3213876088458139652002026278342222208
1/6427752176916279304004052556684444448
1/1285550435383255860800810511336888896
1/2571100870766511721601621022673777792
1/5142201741533023443203242045347555456
1/102844034830660468640648409006951111104
1/205688069661320937281296818013902222208
1/411376139322641874562593636027804444448
1/82275227864528374912518727205560888896
1/164550457329056749825037444011121777792
1/329100914658113499650074888022243555456
1/658201829316226999300149616044487111104
1/1316403658632453998600299230888814222208
1/26328073172649079972005984617776284444448
1/5265614634529815994401196923555256888896
1/1053122927105963998880393846711111104
1/210624585421192799776078769342222208
1/4212491708423855995521575386844444448
1/842498341684771199104315077368888896
1/168499668336954239820863014673777792
1/336999336673908479641726029347555456
1/6739986733478169592834520586951111104
1/1347997346695633918566944117382222208
1/2695994693391267837113888354764444448
1/539198938678253567422777668952888896
1/1078397877356507134845555337905777792
1/2156795754713014279691110675811555456
1/43135915094260285593822213516222208
1/862718301885205711876444270324444448
1/172543660377041143755288854064888896
1/345087320754082287510577708129777792
1/690174641508164575021155401619555456
1/1380349283016329150043110832381111104
1/276069856603265830008621666466222208
1/552139713206531660017243332924444448
1/1104279426413063320034486666584888896
1/2208558852826126640068973333169777792
1/4417117705652253280137946666339555456
1/88342354113045065602758933326791111104
1/17668470822609013120551786665358222208
1/353369416452180262411035733307164444448
1/70673883290436052482207146661432888896
1/14134776658087210496441429332865777792
1/28269553316174420992882856665731555456
1/5653910663234884198576571333146222208
1/11307821326469763971153144662924444448
1/2261564265293952794230628933584888896
1/4523128530587905588461257867169777792
1/904625706117581117692251573433955456
1/180925141223516223538450314686791111104
1/36185028244703244707690062937358222208
1/723700564894064894153801258747164444448
1/14474011297881297883076025174832888896
1/28948022595762595766152050349665777792
1/57896045191525191532304100699331555456
1/1157920903830503830646082013986222208
1/23158418076610076612921640279724444448
1/4631683615322015322584328055944888896
1/9263367230644030645168656111889777792
1/185267344612806128903373222377955456
1/37053468922561225780674644475591111104
1/741069378